

**Steve Taffolla**

---

**From:** Donna Tisdale <tisdale.donna@gmail.com>  
**Sent:** Monday, February 14, 2011 5:20 PM  
**To:** aei@cpuc.ca.gov; ECOSUB  
**Subject:** 2 ECO Tule ESJ comment letters  
**Attachments:** McCallister Tule ECO ESJ 2-12-11.pdf; Mauris Tule ECO ESJ 2-12-11.pdf

Hello PUC/ Dudek

Hard copies of the attached similar letters from 2 senior couples were mailed to Dudek today.

The McCallister's home and 80 acre property will be sandwiched between the Tule turbines (G line), the Sunrise Powerlink, one of the proposed routes for the 138 kV line for Tule, and one of Tule Wind Substation proposed for APN 61103001 owned by Harmony Grove.

The Mauris's home and property is to the west of the Tule turbines (G line).

Regards,

Donna Tisdale  
619-766-4170

\*\*\*\*\*  
This footnote confirms that this email message has been scanned by  
PineApp Mail-SeCure for the presence of malicious code, vandals & computer viruses.  
\*\*\*\*\*

**Robert & Kathryn Mc Callister  
3032 McCain Valley Road  
Boulevard, CA 91905**

February 12, 2011

Mr. Iain Fisher, CPUC  
Mr. Greg Thomsen, BLM,  
c/o Dudek  
605 Third Street,  
Encinitas, CA 92024

**Draft EIR-EIS : Tule Wind, ECO Substation, Energia Sierra Juarez**

Dear Mr. Fisher and Mr. Thomsen,

This letter is being provided to ensure that our concerns and strong opposition are documented in the record for these large wind turbine, substation, and power line projects that your agencies are reviewing. We may need to join in filing a future lawsuit for damages related to loss of property value, quality of life, the use and enjoyment of our property, and other potential adverse effects.

We are both in our 80's, are in good health, and live full time on the 80 acres we own located at 3032 McCain Valley Road, in Boulevard. Until recently, this was a beautiful and quiet place to live and to invite family and friends join us. All that has changed and we are now very concerned for our own future and that of our neighbors, pets, livestock and the local wildlife.

A moratorium on industrial wind turbine projects should be initiated by local state, and federal agencies, unless and until science-based peer reviewed health and safety tests are conducted to determine a safe setback distance. To date, those studies have not been done and industrial wind energy supporters cannot claim otherwise.

You are now reviewing three energy projects, along with the additional proposed wind turbine projects on the Manzanita and Campo Reservations and Greg Lansing's ranch lands on Ribbonwood Road and Jewel Valley Road. San Diego Gas & Electric's large 500 kV Sunrise Powerlink towers and lines will also be installed all along the eastern edge of McCain Valley Road and our eastern property boundary about 1,000 feet or so from our home.

The Tule Wind turbines, that will stand almost 500 feet tall, are planned to be installed approximately 2,200 feet or some from our home along the top of the ridge just west of our property.

The new Tule Wind 138 kV transmission line is also planned to run right next to the Sunrise Powerlink lines along McCain Valley Road, our only access road. More Tule Wind turbines are also planned for private land on the ridgeline to the north east of our home. A new 5 acre substation and 5 acre operation and maintenance building,

for the Tule Wind project, are also planned for the open pasture on private property just to the north of us, or for the Rough Acres Ranch property just to the southwest of us.

**There are several main concerns that we want your agencies to address and respond to:**

1) Increased risk of fire; increased fire insurance rates or total loss of coverage due to new high risk development near our home; reduced fire fighting access due to increased potential for electrocution to fire fighters.

Power lines, turbines, substation transformers can all start fires. This can translate into a life or death situation for us, with only one access road and limited local fire fighting staff availability, equipment, and funding.

2) Noise and low frequency pollution from industrial wind turbines, some below the level of human hearing, can and does make people and animals ill when turbines are placed too close to homes, livestock, and sensitive wildlife areas. It has been reported that families have even abandoned their homes to escape the unbearable living conditions that are inflicted by these power generating turbine. Increased medical expenses and long-distance round trips for medical attention can really add up. Impacts to pets and livestock can also be severe and expensive.

3) 2,200 feet is way too close for turbines. We don't want them anywhere near our home or the homes of other families. They should be placed several miles away from any occupied buildings, livestock, public recreation areas, campgrounds, and protected wildlife areas.

4) Electrical pollution, stray voltage, has been documented in and around other wind turbine and substation projects and homes within 1,800 feet and much more. There are indications that wind turbines and the substations that serve them are more prone to generate electrical pollution due to the intermittent nature of the energy they produce.

4) Shadow flicker from turbines can extend several thousand feet during certain times of day and can create a harmful pulsing light effect that can result in vertigo, seizures, or other adverse effects. That strobe effect also has adverse effects on pets, livestock and wildlife. Our home and property will likely be impacted during the late afternoon and evening hours.

5) Property value losses are being recorded at other wind turbine projects. We join others in requesting that Tule Wind be required to enter into binding Property Value Protection Agreements to ensure that we do not suffer lost value or the inability to sell our property, if rendered necessary, due to the adverse impacts generated by the proximity of their massive wind turbines, power lines, and substations that will surround us.

6) We are requesting that any project approvals include binding contractual agreements for adequate and ongoing funding for third party unbiased pre-construction testing for ambient noise, low frequencies and infrasound, and dirty electricity levels to be taken both inside and outside our home and at all our property lines. We are also requesting ongoing monitoring and enforceable

compliance guarantees that include shutdown of non-compliant turbines--in the event these projects are approved over our objections.

7) The County noise ordinance and turbine setbacks are currently inadequate to protect public health and safety and cannot be relied upon for these projects. Compliance with those standards, as stated in the Draft EIR/EIS will NOT insure against the generation of a nuisance. Your agencies must address this issue. Our rural ambient noise levels are much lower than stated in the Draft EIR/EIS. Complaints have been generated at other wind energy projects with only minimal increases in noise levels. All ranges of noise levels, audible and inaudible need to be documented at pre-construction levels--and protected.



8) We also have concerns over adverse impacts to both the quality and quantity of our well water. Tule Wind will be clearing, grading, and blasting for turbine footings and new access roads. They will also be drawing large amounts of well water from several wells on Rough Acres Ranch for cement batch plants and other operational uses. Their turbines, substation, transformers, and maintenance buildings will contain hazardous fluids that can spill or leak into the water table. Our water levels should be documented by a licensed unbiased third party prior to commercial uses at nearby wells. We have no economically viable alternative source of water available to replace what we currently have.

9) Day time strobe lights and red blinking night lighting on the turbines and some of the transmission towers will create another nuisance both day and night ,and take away from our beautiful dark night sky, one of the few left in Southern California.

In short, we strongly object to and oppose the introduction of any commercial industrial scale wind turbines , the related infrastructure, and all the adverse impacts that go with them, into our quiet rural neighborhood.

Any approvals of such would constitute a nuisance based on bulk and scale, blinking lights, noise levels (including low frequency and infrasonic), disruption to the peaceful use and enjoyment of our home and property and the very real potential for adverse health effects. While ignored, denied, and dismissed by the wind energy industry, growing evidence documents that some home owners have been bought out by wind energy companies due to undeniable adverse effects. The problems are real and must be addressed by your agencies prior to any project decisions.

Sincerely,

  
  
Robert and Kathryn Mc Callister

cc: Donna Tisdale

**John & Iris Mauris  
2945 Ribbonwood Road  
Boulevard, CA 91905**

February 12, 2011

Mr. Iain Fisher, CPUC  
Mr. Greg Thomsen, BLM,  
c/o Dudek  
605 Third Street,  
Encinitas, CA 92024

**Draft EIR-EIS : Tule Wind, ECO Substation, Energia Sierra Juarez**

Dear Mr. Fisher and Mr. Thomsen,

This letter is being provided to ensure that our concerns and strong opposition are documented in the record for these large wind turbine, substation, and power line projects that your agencies are reviewing. We may need to join in filing a future lawsuit for damages related to loss of property value, quality of life, the use and enjoyment of our property, and other potential adverse effects.

We are both up in years and live full time on property we own located at 2945 Ribbonwood Road, in Boulevard. Until recently, this was a beautiful and quiet place to live and to invite family and friends join us, except for the Kumeyaay turbines that we have to look at and can hear thumping away even though they are over 3 miles to the west. We are now very concerned for our own future and that of our neighbors, pets, livestock and the local wildlife. We do have several horses.

A moratorium on industrial wind turbine projects should be initiated by local stater and federal agencies, unless and until science-based peer reviewed health and safety tests are conducted to determine a safe setback distance. To date, those studies have not been done and industrial wind energy supporters cannot claim otherwise.

You are now reviewing three energy projects, along with the additional proposed wind turbine projects on the Manzanita and Campo Reservations and Greg Lansing's ranch lands on Ribbonwood Road and Jewel Valley Road. San Diego Gas & Electric's large 500 kV Sunrise Powerlink towers and lines will also be installed all along the eastern edge of McCain Valley Road and will swing around to the north and northwest of our property.

The Tule Wind turbines, that will stand almost 500 feet tall, are planned to be installed approximately 4,500 feet or some from our home along the top of the ridge just east of our property.

One route for the new Tule Wind 138 kV transmission line is also planned to run near our property. A new 5 acre substation and 5 acre operation and maintenance building, for the Tule Wind project, are also planned for the Rough Acres Ranch property southeast of us.

The Enel Jewel Valley Project and turbines ( previously called Jordan Wind) are proposed for land immediately west of us at the north end of Ribbonwood Road. Proposed new Manzanita and Campo turbines will only add to the visual blight and adverse effects already generated by the 25 Kumeyaay Wind turbines that we hear and see from over 3 miles away!

**There are several main concerns that we want your agencies to address and respond to:**

1) Increased risk of fire; increased fire insurance rates or total loss of coverage due to new high risk development near our home; reduced fire fighting access due to increased potential for electrocution to fire fighters. Power lines, turbines, substation transformers can all start fires. This can translate into a life or death situation for us, with only one access road and limited local fire fighting staff availability, equipment, and funding.

2) Noise and low frequency pollution from industrial wind turbines, some below the level of human hearing, can and does make people and animals ill when turbines are placed too close to homes, livestock, and sensitive wildlife areas. It has been reported that families have even abandoned their homes to escape the unbearable living conditions that are inflicted by these power generating turbine. Increased medical expenses and long-distance round trips for medical attention can really add up. Impacts to pets and livestock can also be severe and expensive. Wind turbines, as we know, can be heard for miles and infrasound can travel great distances in our type of open terrain.

3) 4,500 feet is way too close for turbines. 3 miles is too close! We don't want them anywhere near our home or the homes of other families. They should be placed miles and miles away from any occupied buildings, livestock, public recreation areas, campgrounds, and protected wildlife areas.

4) Electrical pollution, stray voltage, has been documented in and around other wind turbine and substation projects and homes within 1,800 feet and much more. There are indications that wind turbines and the substations

that serve them are more prone to generate electrical pollution due to the intermittent nature of the energy they produce.

4) Shadow flicker from turbines can extend several thousand feet during certain times of day and can create a harmful pulsing light effect that can result in vertigo, seizures, or other adverse effects. That strobe effect also has adverse effects on pets, livestock and wildlife. Our home and property will likely be impacted during the late afternoon and evening hours.

5) Property value losses are being recorded at other wind turbine projects. We join others in requesting that Tule Wind be required to enter into binding Property Value Protection Agreements to ensure that we do not suffer lost value or the inability to sell our property, if rendered necessary, due to the adverse impacts generated by the proximity of their massive wind turbines, power lines, and substations that will surround us.

6) We are requesting that any project approvals include binding contractual agreements for adequate and ongoing funding for third party unbiased pre-construction testing for ambient noise, low frequencies and infrasound, and dirty electricity levels to be taken both inside and outside our home and at all our property lines. We are also requesting ongoing monitoring and enforceable compliance guarantees that include shutdown of non-compliant turbines--in the event these projects are approved over our objections.

7) The County noise ordinance and turbine setbacks are currently inadequate to protect public health and safety and cannot be relied upon for these projects. Compliance with those standards, as stated in the Draft EIRjEIS will NOT insure against the generation of a nuisance. Your agencies must address this issue. Our rural ambient noise levels are much lower than stated in the Draft EIRjEIS. Complaints have been generated at other wind energy projects with only minimal increases in noise levels. All ranges of noise levels, audible and inaudible need to be documented at pre-construction levels--and protected.

8) We also have concerns over adverse impacts to both the quality and quantity of our well water. Tule Wind will be clearing, grading, and blasting for turbine footings and new access roads. They will also be drawing large amounts of well water from several wells on Rough Acres Ranch for cement batch plants and other operational uses. The Enel project represents additional impacts. All these turbines, substation, transformers, and maintenance buildings will contain hazardous fluids that can spill or leak into the water table. Our water levels should be documented by a licensed unbiased third party prior to commercial uses at nearby wells. We have no economically viable alternative source of water available to replace what we currently have.

9) Day time strobe lights and red blinking night lighting on the turbines and some of the transmission towers will create another nuisance both day and night ,and take away from our beautiful dark night sky, one of the few left in Southern California.

In short, we strongly object to and oppose the introduction of any commercial industrial scale wind turbines, the related infrastructure, and all the adverse impacts that go with them, into our quiet rural neighborhood.

Any approvals of such would constitute a nuisance based on bulk and scale, blinking lights, noise levels (including low frequency and infrasonic), disruption to the peaceful use and enjoyment of our home and property and the very real potential for adverse health effects. While ignored, denied, and dismissed by the wind energy industry, growing evidence documents that some home owners have been bought out by wind energy companies due to undeniable adverse effects. The problems are real and must be addressed by your agencies prior to any project decisions.

Sincerely,   
  
John and Iris Mauris

cc: Donna Tisdale